

To Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Center for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance in Higher
Education and Health Care
10.05.2022

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
EVALUATION OF THE PHD EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 8D10139
"PUBLIC HEALTH CARE" OF THE NON-PROFIT JOINT-STOCK
COMPANY "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA" FOR
COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION
OF PHD EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES IN HEALTH CARE

period of external expert evaluation: April 27-29, 2022

Karaganda, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1.	Presentation of the non-profit joint-stock company "Medical University of Karaganda and PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 "Public Health Care"	4
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	5
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 "Public Health Care" for compliance with the Standards for the accreditation of PhD educational programmes in public health and conclusions	5
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	6
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and doctoral students	13
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care»	15
6.	Recommendations for improving the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care»	25
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	26
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and PhD educational programme in specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care»	27
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	28

List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Designation
AIS	Automated Information System
AMP	administrative and managerial staff
University	Higher education institution
EEC	External expert commission
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
IT	Information technology
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTB	material and technical base
NJSC “MUK”	Non-Profit Joint Stock Company “Medical University of Karaganda”
RW	Research work
NLA	Normative legal acts
STP	Scientific and technical programmes
EP	Educational programme
TS	Teaching staff
AT	Advanced Training
POL	Problem-oriented learning
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
SU	Structural unit
PhD	Doctor of Philosophy

1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 14 dated 14.04.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care» in the period from 27 to 29 April 2022, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Academic degree, academic title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	KAUYSHEVA ALMAGUL AMANGELDINOVNA	candidate of Medical Sciences, doctor-organizer of health care of the highest category, Vice-rector for educational and scientific activities of the Kazakhstan Medical University "HSPH". Expert on accreditation of medical organizations, Deputy Chairperson of the Board of "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations" RPO
2	Foreign Expert	RAKHIMOV BAHODIR BAHTIYOR SHULLI	doctor of Medical Sciences, Sanitary Doctor, Hygienist and Epidemiologist, Assistant of the School of Public Health of the Tashkent Medical Academy, Researcher of the Koryo University
3	Academic Expert	OSTENOVA GULBARAM OMARGAZIEVA	ph.D., Professor, Head of the Department of Pharmaceutical Technology, Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University
	Academic Expert	TULEUTAIEVA RAYKHAN ESENZHANOVNA	candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine, "Semey Medical University" NJSC
4	Expert-employer	EKATERINA KAMYLEVNA PAVLOVA	senior Provider, Paracelsus LLP, Paracelsus Pharmacy Network
5	Master's student	MAHMOUD NAZERKE SAIDUALIKYZY	Graduate student of the first year of study in the specialty "Pharmacy" of "Medical University of Astana" NJSC

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The ECAQA report contains an assessment of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 "Public Health care" for compliance with the Standards for the accreditation of educational programmes in the specialties of the PhD in Health care and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the non-profit joint-stock company "Medical University of Karaganda and PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 "Public Health Care"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda"
Management body	Board of Directors
Full name of the chief executive officer	acting Chairperson of the Management Board-Rector Turmukhambetova Anar Akylbekovna
Created in	1950
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda region, M01K6T3 karaganda, str. Gogol, 40 Phone: +7 7212 503930, Fax: +7 7212 518931, E-mail: info@qmu.kz Official Website: www.qmu.kz
State license for educational activities in PhD doctoral studies (date, number)	No. KZ32LAA00016018 dated May 06, 2019.
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	Not available
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2013-2014 school year Year
Duration of training	3 (three) years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	21
Number of doctoral students at EP since the beginning of the current year	7
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	Regular -9, degree 100%

The Medical University of Karaganda is one of the oldest educational and scientific centers in the region. It has many years of successful experience in scientific research in the field of medicine, biology, ecology, "green" technologies, education, labor protection, ensuring the safe conduct of work, etc.

The first recruitment of doctoral students for the educational programme of the doctoral programme of the specialty "Public Health care" (scientific and pedagogical direction) was carried out in the 2013-2014 academic year. Since the beginning of the implementation of the educational programme of the doctoral programme in the specialty "Public Health care" 33 doctoral students have been enrolled in training, 21 people have been trained, 7 doctoral dissertations have been successfully defended, 7 graduates have been awarded the PhD degree, 7 people continue their studies.

2.2. Information on previous accreditation

The previous accreditation was carried out in 2017 by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA). The validity of the accreditation certificate is June 19, 2017 - June 17, 2022.

http://esuvo.platonus.kz/#/register/education_programme/application/34710

ECAQA_Евразийский центр аккредитации и обеспечения качества образования и здравоохранения

2.3 Conclusion on the results of the analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the Non-Profit Joint-Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes of PhD in health care and conclusions

The self-assessment report on the PhD educational programme 8D10139 "Public Health care" of the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda" is presented on 67 pages and contains 3 annexes according to the relevant standards, electronic versions of copies of documents are posted on Google disk at https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ENVJt6PDICIBei_EjHNOFamjmV_b7HZg.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 8 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. A cover letter signed by Anar Akylbekovna Turmukhambetova, Acting Chairperson of the Management Board and Rector, confirming the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report, is attached to the report.

The report contains a list of 5 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Yernazarova Madina Aynullaevna, Chief Specialist of the Strategic Development Department.

The self-assessment of the educational programme in the specialty PhD of the doctoral programme 8D10139 "Public Health care" was carried out on the basis of the order dated January 28, 2021 No.31 "On approval of the composition of the committee for conducting self-assessment" of the educational programme PhD of the doctoral programme 8D10139 "Public Health care".

The report was analyzed by the accreditation expert Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldinovna. Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

All standards provide real practice of the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda" for the preparation of doctoral students in the specialty 8D10139 "Public Health care", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in the 2021-2022 academic year, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement. The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 "Public Health care" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external

evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by the order of the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. No.14 dated April 14, 2022 and agreed with the Acting Chairperson of the Board-Rector of the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda" Turmukhambetova Anar Akylbekovna. Dates of the visit to the organization: April 27-29, 2022

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 14 people in total;
- interviews with doctoral students - 7 people;
- study of the [website https://www.qmu.edu.kz/en/](https://www.qmu.edu.kz/en/);
- interviewing employees, teachers - 12 people;
- questionnaires of teachers and doctoral students – 12 and 7, respectively;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards - 2 practice bases were visited, including the Institute of Public Health care, the Scientific Research Sanitary and Hygienic Laboratory, where training is carried out under the educational programme 8D10139 "Public Health care" with the participation of 9 full-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 18 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews.

Thus, the implementation of the activities of the programme, the results of the interview with the acting first head of the organization; the vice-rector for academic work; members of the Dissertation Council and key employees of MUK NJSC, made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria of accreditation standards, to identify approaches in the development of the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, guaranteeing the sufficiency of educational resources. In interviews with doctoral students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of the **standard 1,2,6,8 was established**. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization and the main goals of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the content of strategic documents was brought to the attention of doctoral candidates through the website, social networks, information letters to medical and scientific organizations. The research activities of the University are carried out in accordance with the Strategic Plans of the University for 2014-2018 and 2017-2021, currently in accordance with the Development Programme of the Research University for 2019-2023. Target indicators of the Programme for the Development of the Research University of MUK NJSC were approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 27, 2019 No. 453. The priority areas of research of the University for 2017-2021 (Protocol of the Academic Council No.8 dated April 10, 2017) are:

- Preventive environment as the basis of public health care;
- Personalized approach in the management of a number of significant diseases;
- Complex research aimed at the development and introduction into pharmaceutical production of medicinal products based on domestic herbal raw materials;
- Medical and social problems of old age and old age;

- Research in the field of medical education.

which confirms the implementation of **Standard 1** and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with doctoral students, it was found that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Having familiarized themselves with the documents, having visited the practice bases, the SU, during the interviews, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, receive feedback from the teacher or scientific consultant, have the opportunity to improve their skills in the field of public health care, scientific search, information analysis, statistical data processing. The Organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, as reflected in the document "Academic Policy" (August 27, 2021, Minutes No.1), Section "Code of Academic Integrity".

Compliance with ethical standards in the scientific component in the training of doctoral students is reflected in the "Regulations on the Ethical Commission for the Evaluation of Scientific Research of MUK NJSC". Approved by the Resolution of the Management Board on February 25, 2022. Minutes No.5. During the interview, doctoral students replied that they were informed about the activities of this commission.

When visiting the practice bases and talking to doctoral students, the experts saw that the organization contributes to the development of scientific, practical and pedagogical competencies of future PhDs using the capabilities of the Institute of Public Health care, the Scientific and Research Sanitary and Hygienic Laboratory; the Laboratory of Collective Use.

Analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of methodological materials, and scientific leaders apply them when working with doctoral students.

Experts studied the following documents: Educational Programme 8D10139 "Public Health care" (24.06.21, Protocol No. 30. Appr. By the Board of Directors); Academic Policy; Regulations on Doctorate at NJSC MUK (Approved on 26.08.2019. Minutes No.8 of the Management Board), Regulations on the dissertation council of the Medical University of Karaganda, NJSC (Approved by the Decision of the Management Board on August 16, 2021, Minutes No.22).

Thus, compliance with **standard 8 has been established.**

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with employees - Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management – Bukeeva Aliya Satybaldievna, Director of the Department of Human Resources Management – Kravtsiv Elena Alexandrovna, Director of the Department of Academic Work – Kasatova Aida Magatovna, the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers/scientific managers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of units, contracts with teachers, orders, orders, academic policy, Regulations on doctoral studies and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, sheets), certificates. A review of the website showed that the University's Internet resource is functioning, on which educational resources are available for faculty and students, information about structural units is posted, the main events in the life of the university are covered.

The conversation with the Head of the Public Health care Department allowed the experts to learn about the approaches to attracting full-time employees as scientific managers - 5 people (100% degree):

Molotov-Luchansky Vilen Borisovich – Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor
Sorokina Marina Anatolyevna – Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor
Kalishev Marat Guzairovich - Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor

Kulov Dyusentai Barkenovich - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor

Omarkulov Bauyrzhan Kadenovich - Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, as well as on the strategy and tactics of admission of doctoral students to this specialty, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, as there is a problem of shortage and "leakage of personnel" to the capital, located in the territorial proximity.

Interviews with 12 full-time teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in educational management, depending on the specific base (admission of doctoral students to equipment and office equipment, for the set of material for the thesis). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers and scientific managers, the availability of teachers' certification in teaching methods and scientific research.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with **standard 3**.

In order to verify these **standards 3,5,6**, external experts on the basis of the study of materials and interviews with doctoral students, faculty members, AMP received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers and leadership skills of scientific consultants of doctoral students, motivation to work with doctoral students, implementation of the system of scientific leadership.

Planning and consulting support of the doctoral student is carried out individually, depending on the need, the theme and scope of the dissertation research, external and internal problems and the conditions of their conduct.

The organization of the work of scientific consultants on the management of the doctoral dissertation and the duties of a scientific consultant are described in the "Regulations on doctoral studies in NJSC "MUK". In paragraph 48 of the Regulation, the scientific consultant is assigned to monitor the implementation of the individual work plan of the doctoral student, discuss the results of the work, adjust the publications prepared and assist in their publication, methodological assistance in the preparation of the dissertation work, followed by its verification.

It should be noted that the number of assigned doctoral students exceeds 3 people, which will allow qualitatively prepare the applicant for a doctorate. Scientific consultants consult with their doctoral students at least 5-6 times a month. The teaching staff note that during the consultations, the degree and quality of the performed scientific research, the compliance of their individual work plan, recommendations on theoretical and experimental issues of research, etc. are assessed. Scientific consultants create conditions for the successful implementation of tasks, carry out systematic monitoring at all stages of research, discuss the results, make the necessary adjustments and provide assistance at individual stages of the dissertation work. This allows scientific consultants to significantly intensify the doctoral student's process of mastering theoretical knowledge with their implementation in the performance of scientific work through a personality-oriented approach, that is, as close as possible to the learning process to the needs of practice. As it turned out from the materials of the Self-Assessment Report and during the interview, the duties of scientific consultants are reflected in paragraph 48 "Regulations on doctoral studies in the NJSC "MUK" and involve a number of general duties (monitoring the implementation of the doctoral thesis and research work of the doctoral student according to the individual work plan of the doctoral student; providing feedback on the implementation of the doctoral thesis (for semester – domestic scientific consultants, for annual – domestic and foreign scientific consultants); providing an invitation (foreign scientific consultant) on the official form of the organization for scientific internship; discussing the results together with the doctoral student, etc.), at the same time, NJSC "MUK" does not practice signing an agreement between the scientific supervisor, doctoral student and the head of the doctoral programme (university), with a specific distribution of responsibilities of each of the interested parties; the appointment of a mentor for each doctoral student is not practiced in addition to the existing scientific supervisors. Training courses on improving pedagogical qualifications, on the policy of implementing educational programmes, including doctoral

programmes, are regularly held for teaching staff, but leading scientific supervisors of the doctoral student did not receive formalized training on scientific guidance.

During doctoral students' pedagogical and research internships, consultants discuss issues related to the implementation of the practice plan, problems associated with its implementation, monitor the quality of tasks and provide the necessary advice.

During visits to clinical bases, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and students, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with **Standard 2, 6**, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

Visiting the bases and studying the materials allowed us to establish that our own educational resources are located in six educational buildings, which house:

23 lecture halls, designed for 2 657 seats, in lecture halls modern facilities for multimedia accompaniment of lectures are permanently installed;

276 classrooms with 5,667 seats and rigid equipment;

7 specialized offices designed for the discipline of biostatistics, equipped with personal computers, thin clients and R, epi-info programmes.

research center and 12 specialized laboratories (sanitary and hygienic laboratory, biochemical laboratory, physiological laboratory, microbiological laboratory, immunological laboratory, pathomorphological laboratory, PCR laboratory, pharmacokinetic laboratory) equipped with special modern equipment for training students in research skills; for model and experimental studies on laboratory animals at the NJSC MUK operates vivarium, providing the maintenance and reproduction of animals.

12 computer rooms with 277 seats connected to the Internet;

2 gyms of 1970.1 m², ski base (1388.5 m²);

library, reading room for 404 seats;

1 assembly hall for 650 seats, equipped with 2 multimedia projectors, special lighting and music equipment;

editorial and publishing department with a publishing capacity of 68,800 printed sheets per year;

center for Simulation and Educational Technologies;

In order to increase the ranking of scientific activity and publication activity of the University by promoting its scientific works on the Internet in 2018, the "MUK NJSC Repository" was created (<http://repoz.qmu.kz/>), included in the global catalog of open access repositories Open doar and in the Google Scholar search engine. In 2022, the number of publications and scientific works placed in the "NJSC MUK Repository" is 427 scientific works.

The set of training laboratory rooms meets the requirements of the State Standard for the Specialty. The laboratories are equipped with plenum and exhaust ventilation with mechanical motives and separate (autonomous) ventilation devices for suction of air from the exhaust cabinets in accordance with the requirements of the current BC&R. The material and technical base of the laboratories is updated with modern equipment.

The main range of research is carried out in the Research Center, which since 2012 includes the Laboratory of collective use, created on the basis of the University in the framework of the implementation of the State Programme of Health Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Salamatty Kazakhstan" and according to the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 9, 2012 №464 "On the creation of modern scientific laboratories (centers of collective use)". The laboratory was created as a collective use center for scientific and educational centers of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The total budget for the acquisition of high-tech equipment in the period from 2012 amounted to 1 030 million tenge.

The resources of the laboratory were used in 3 scientific and technical programmes and 19 grant projects (of which 7 under the supervision of laboratory staff). The laboratory took part in international projects and agreements (SMART – a global international project for the assessment of antibiotic

resistance; metall (2013-2016) – a study of the epidemiology and clonal structure of microorganisms producing metallo-beta-lactamases in the CIS countries; International Marathon study (2013-2015) - a study of the epidemiology of nosocomial infections; International study of the clonal structure of streptococcal infectious agents in the Baltic States and the CIS 2015-2016; International study of resistance to antibiotics Mycoplasma and Chlamydia).

The laboratory carried out joint projects with scientific and practical clinical organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan: the State Medical University of Semey; Regional and city children's hospitals of Karaganda; JSC "International Scientific and Production Holding" Phytochemistry"; National Center for Biotechnology; National Scientific and Medical Center, Medical Center for Presidential Affairs Management.

The laboratory participates in supporting young researches and creates a basis for research work of undergraduates and doctoral students, it is the basis for a number of practical classes and training of students.

The staff of the laboratory is 13 units, including 1 manager, 8 researchers (employees directly carrying out scientific research and supporting basic and applied research) 4 units of service personnel (personnel providing information and technical support for the functioning of the Laboratory equipment).

The shared use laboratory is located in a separate wing of the first floor of a four-storey planned building with an autonomous ventilation and air cleaning system, a system of double duplication of power supply, a set of specialized rooms. The total area of the Laboratory is 1023.1 sq.m.

To date, the list of RC PVC equipment includes more than 25 high-tech devices and a full range of auxiliary equipment to provide a wide range of biomedical research. The paint and lacquer equipment fleet undergoes mandatory service support. Service includes both maintenance and scientific advice from manufacturers, support services to ensure proper operation of the devices. There are also costs for periodic verification of measuring instruments in operation of the laboratory and services of refilling cylinders (carbon dioxide, helium, nitrogen and argon).

Thus, the University has a material and technical base for providing training in doctoral studies and scientific and technical, scientific and methodological, clinical, experimental base for conducting scientific research in the field of medicine and related sciences, corresponding to the qualification requirements for the activities of educational organizations implementing educational programmes of postgraduate education with the award of a degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) and a doctor in the field (Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities, and the list of documents confirming compliance with them" dated June 17, 2015 No.391).

The Research Sanitary and Hygienic Laboratory (RUSHL) of the University is accredited in accordance with GOST ISO/IEC 17025 – 2019 "General requirements for the competence of testing and calibration laboratories", has a highly qualified staff: 2 doctors and 3 candidates of sciences, 7 masters with many years of scientific and practical experience in the field of public health care, occupational health, prevention of occupational diseases. All employees of the laboratory regularly undergo training in labor protection, industrial and fire safety, have appropriate certificates and certificates for direct performance of work at harmful and hazardous production facilities.

The research sanitary and hygienic laboratory is provided with all the necessary legislative and regulatory documentation on the work of the laboratory and the research methods used. Thus, MTB of the university allows to provide a scientific component to students.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about the satisfaction with the training, the adequacy of time for the supervision of patients, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for students in need, participation in scientific work, the availability of a

resource of international databases of professional literature. The skills of using these resources were assessed when visiting the library and publishing center - director Yana Olegovna Amirova.

In general, doctoral students are satisfied with the training and scientific guidance, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, the wishes of doctoral students include an active referral for internships, including international ones, suspended due to the alarming epidemiological situation during the pandemic.

The doctoral students showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training and providing conditions for the performance of the dissertation research, the submission of a thesis for defense, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in the activities of the organization of education, funding. Experts studied the documents of doctoral students (portfolio, evaluation results, questionnaire results, abstracts, dissertations).

Interviews with potential employers of university graduates were conducted offline / online (some were away) and included such issues as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the updating of the EP, the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of doctoral students, mutually beneficial interaction with the university, the formation of critical and research thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments, employment of graduates on completion of doctoral studies, etc. Employers in their answers noted that the university provides support to practical health care (volunteering of students during the pandemic, consultations of difficult patients, etc.), confirmed their participation in the updating of the EP, but not specifically the EP of the doctoral programme "Public Health care", participation in the fair of vacancies of graduates. None of the employers present was a member of the collegial bodies of the university. (I previously noted, but did not make a recommendation. Now I did)

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for the External Evaluation of the PhD Educational Programme in the Specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care» for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, and the chairperson of Kadysheva A.A. held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period – 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NEI "KRMU", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

Conclusion:

The EEC members carefully studied the materials provided, assessed the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, the implementation of activities of the visiting programme of NJSC "MUK" is analyzed. All the information obtained is compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to verify the reliability of the information provided by the university and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

The educational programme of the doctorate 8D10139 «Public Health Care» corresponds to the mission of the NJSC "MUK", the development of the university as a research university. The PhD programme 8D10139 «Public Health Care» allows you to build an individual educational trajectory, takes into account the needs of career growth and the capabilities of doctoral students. The PhD has specific features and takes into account the needs of employers, students and teaching staff, who are actively involved in the process of developing, approving and revising the PhD. The university employs highly qualified scientific and pedagogical staff and has the conditions to improve the educational and intellectual level of doctoral students. Cooperation of the university with educational institutions of the republic, near and far abroad can contribute to the demand for this educational programme not only at the national level, but also at the international level.

To achieve the goals and further improve the PhD programme, the university continuously monitors and periodically evaluates the educational programme. Employers should be more actively involved in this process. The student support service and the management of the EP ensure that the needs of doctoral students are met.

Training of personnel in the educational programme will contribute to the further improvement of the educational and research potential of MUK NJSC, strengthen its position in the domestic and global research community.

During the external expert assessment, the members of the sec studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan, academic policy, curricula, regulations, etc.), teachers' publications, rules for admission to doctoral studies, personnel policy, internal quality assurance system.

Resources for training were reviewed directly on the practice bases, which made it possible to identify compliance with the requirements of the EP, accessibility for teachers and students, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care.

Through interviews with teachers, their direct participation in the development and implementation of the EP, mechanisms for its improvement through regular monitoring, study of feedback, among other things, was determined.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, the sufficiency of time for practical training, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and teachers' qualifications.

Students in the process of interviewing and based on the results of the questionnaire showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, funding, etc.).

4. Results of the survey.

The ECAQA observer conducted an online questionnaire on 27-29.04.2022 at <https://webanketa.com/>.

The survey of doctoral students includes 22 questions.

A total of 7 people responded (a total of 7 doctoral students for the current year).

The results of the survey generally demonstrate satisfactory management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of the organization of training, almost all respondents show a level of full satisfaction - 88.5% in key areas related to educational programmes: organization of the educational process, schedule, evaluation methods, fairness of student evaluation, classroom equipment, the availability of practice database resources, library fund, communication with teachers and university management. The results of the survey made it possible to identify areas for improvement (programmes of material and social support for teachers, accessibility of management and administration for teachers and students, scientific work).

Analysis of the conducted survey of students of the doctoral programme showed a high commitment of students to this university and overall satisfaction with the quality and organization of the educational

process, such as the "Yes" answers: Programme managers and teaching staff are aware of the problems of students -82.35%; I like to study in this organization of education -76.47%; this organization of education allows to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty you chose-88.24%; Satisfied with the organization of teaching -82.35%; Involved managers and/or teachers in activities to prepare for institutional or specialized (programme) accreditation (DA) -29.41%; There are published printed works during the training in this organization of education (articles, abstracts, reviews - more than one publication -47.06%; Do you currently do research work - 94.12%; Accessibility of the management of the organization of education for students - 94.12%; Did you personally experience a negative attitude of teachers ("NO" answers) – 82.35%; After completing the classes, does the teacher conduct feedback with you (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, work on errors) - 76.47%; Teachers in the classes use active and interactive methods of teaching-88.24%; The content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty meets my expectations-76.47%; I am satisfied with the schedule of educational classes in the disciplines of the educational programme-94.12%; The organization of education has a system of independent education of students, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students and students-82.35%; In the organization of education there are social programmes to support students-82.35%; Satisfaction with the activities of mentors, curators, scientific managers-88.24%; Access to electronic educational resources-82.35%; In the organization of education there is access to the participation of students in research work - 94.12%; I am satisfied with the conditions and equipment of study rooms, classrooms of this organization of education - 94.12%; Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, scientific council, committees of educational programmes) -88.24%; I will recommend studying in this organization of education to friends, relatives -70.59%.

The results of the survey generally demonstrate a satisfactory attitude to the organization of management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of the organization of training, research and development; material and technical resources; the availability of support services for students and scientific leaders. At the same time, the results of the survey allowed to identify areas for improvement (publication of articles, research results in foreign journals, etc.).

The teacher/supervisor survey included 21 questionnaire questions. In total 12 people (in total in the staff 12) answered, thus pedagogical experience till 5 years – at 8,33%, till 10 years - 16,67%, more than 10 years - 75%.

75% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process; ethics are observed in relations-83.33%; the organization of work is satisfied-75%; there are prospects for career growth-75%; there is an opportunity to engage in science and publications NIR-50%; is satisfied with the salary-50%; is satisfied with the work of the personnel service-83.33%; studied at the courses PK-58.33%; the availability of resources-41.67%; there is a possibility of professional implementation-91.67%; participated in the development of EP-50%; applications for the purchase of office equipment, method of materials and other resources-58.33%; support for participation in conferences-41.67%; access to resources for students-41.67%; publication activity is estimated at "three" points out of five-58.33%; social support of the TS-58.33%; the AMP listen to the opinion of the TS-66.67%; teaching methods used - lectures-83.33% oral analysis-66.67, POL-66.67; interactive training-58.33%; abstracts-41.67%; projects-50%; were involved in the preparation for accreditation-50% of the TS.

The results of the survey in general demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes. There are areas for improvement in terms of wages (half of the respondents are satisfied, resources are available, etc.).

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care»

Standard 1: RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT

Evidence of compliance:

Conditions have been created for the use of information and communication resources, automated information systems are functioning, the library has access to the necessary modern databases.

To ensure the interaction of all types of activities in the university, a single internal local network was created, the website of the university, the "Platonus" and "Documentologist" programmes, and the IP-telephony of divisions and departments of divisions was carried out. Access to the Internet in the workplace is provided to all employees of administrative and management units.

Information and library services for doctoral students are provided by the library, where a significant fund of scientific, educational and methodological literature is collected.

The total area of the library and publishing centre is 1,497.9 square meters, the area of book preservation is 879.2 square meters. The number of seats in the reading rooms is 443. The structure of the library and publishing center includes: a department of completing and bibliography, a department of servicing scientific and educational literature (consists of a subscription of scientific literature, two subscriptions of educational literature, a reading room and a hall of periodicals, a hall of electronic resources, an interactive hall) and an operational printing unit.

The computer park of the library and publishing center consists of 113 computers, 88 of which are thin clients (TC). 21 personal computers (PCs) are located in the divisions of the library and publishing center, 4 PCs and 63 TVs - in the hall of electronic resources and 25 TVs – in the interactive hall, the entire fleet of computers is connected to the INTERNET. WiFi is available throughout the library and publishing centre.

There are 2 scanners for users in the Electronic Resources Hall. The interactive hall is equipped with a short-focus projector.

For doctoral students and faculty, there is a Research Fellow's Hall equipped with 15 computers connected to the Internet, which allows access to all information resources of the university.

Two information kiosks are installed in the MUK library and publishing center, with the help of which users can order the necessary literature electronically through the electronic catalog based on the "Web-irbis" module. During the pandemic, as noted by students, the necessary sources were sent to e-mail and were available.

The total fund of the University Library and Publishing Center as of 01.01.2022 is 453,628/43,319 (copies/ titles). The number of seats in the reading room is 443.

Library and Publishing Center of NJSC "MUK" by e-mail and phone constantly and promptly exchanges information with other universities and libraries and publishing houses of Kazakhstan and abroad, maintains contact, receives and provides information to the Association of Universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Informing users is carried out by mailing to Outlook corporate mail, as well as posting information on the website of NJSC "MUK", the Portal of NJSC "MUK" and the Student Portal of NJSC "MUK".

The following databases can be accessed through the Karaganda Medical University website:

- Republican Interuniversity Electronic Library (RIEB)
- Cochrane Library
- Clinical Key Elsevier
- Complete Anatomy Elsevier
- ELS "Lan"
- Student Advisor
- Physician Consultant
- ELS «Book-Up»
- EL "Epigraph"
- Multimedia Textbooks Portal
- Aknurpress Digital Library
- Web of Science (Clarivate)

– Scopus Elsevier

Access to all electronic resources of the university is carried out through the website and portals of MUK.

Full-text electronic publications can be accessed using the electronic library of the medical university "Student Consultant" (<http://www.studmedlib.ru/>), it includes 2,601 electronic educational and additional publications in various disciplines, 167 publications in the Kazakh language, 367 medical periodicals. Access is via an activation code.

Access to the electronic medical library "Doctor's Consultant" (<http://www.rosmedlib.ru/>) is also carried out when entering the activation code. It provides the opportunity to work with various guides, national guidelines for practitioners, clinical guidelines and monographs. "Doctor's Consultant" includes 2,429 publications, 1,313 training modules, 2,056 medical articles, video and audio materials.

ELS "Lan" (<https://e.lanbook.com/>) includes 1396 educational publications on medicine, including for postgraduate education. Access is granted if there is registration in the ELS by the IP addresses of the university. Remote access is provided when attached to the University.

The Republican Interuniversity Electronic Library (RIEB) (<http://rmebrk.kz/>) includes 76417 titles of documents, such as textbooks, educational and methodological publications, abstracts and dissertations, monographs, magazines and video materials in general education disciplines and medicine. Access is provided upon registration by the University corporate mail.

Access to the Web of Science platform was opened in 2011 by national subscription. It is a multidisciplinary electronic research platform that includes interdisciplinary and highly specialized databases.

The Scopus Elsevier citation abstract base, which includes about 38,000 world journals, counts the citation indices of journals and authors. Access is available on a national subscription.

The Library and Publishing Center continues to replenish the full-text databases of its own generation, access to which is provided through the electronic catalog on the MUK website in the case of user authorization (the login is the reader's iin). LDB: "Electronic library" - digitized textbooks and scientific-methodical manuals, conferences - 1983 titles, LDB "History of KSMU" - digitized articles from newspapers and magazines about our university.

The "Library" section in Kazakh, English and Russian languages is available on the website of MUK NJSC at <https://www.qmu.edu.kz/en/>.

The main information resources of the University are located in the automated information system "Platon" on the Student Portal and the official website of "MUK".

The collective use laboratory, the material and technical base of the Institute of Public Health, the Scientific Research Sanitary and Hygienic Laboratory, contributes to the implementation of the EP, the conduct of scientific research in the field of health.

Academic mobility among doctoral students is being implemented. Doctoral students have the opportunity to go on internships, including foreign ones, in accordance with an individual plan.

NJSC MUK is provided with an appropriate research environment, which is characterized by qualified personnel and material, technical and information resources

The research activities of the University are carried out in accordance with the Strategic Plans of the University for 2014-2018 and 2017-2021, currently in accordance with the Development Programme of the Research University for 2019-2023. Target indicators of the Programme for the Development of the Research University of MUK NJSC were approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 27, 2019 No. 453.

The priority areas of research of the University for 2017-2021 (Protocol of the Academic Council No.8 dated April 10, 2017) are:

- Preventive environment as the basis of public health;
- Personalized approach in the management of a number of significant diseases;
- Complex research aimed at the development and introduction into pharmaceutical production of medicinal products based on domestic herbal raw materials;

- Medical and social problems of old age and old age;
- Research in the field of medical education.

Scientists of NJSC "MUK" actively participate in competitions for grant funding of scientific research of the Committee of Science of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In 2016, NJSC MUK as the parent organization completed the NTP on the topic: "Environmental risks and public health" within the framework of programme-targeted funding of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Scientific supervisor - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Dosmagambetova R.S. (implementation period 2014-2016). As a co-executor, they participated in the implementation of the STP "Integrated approaches to managing the health of the population of the Aral Sea region" commissioned by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (implementation period 2014-2016, the parent organization of the Republican State Enterprise on REM "National Center for Occupational Health and Diseases")

Scientific research in 2017-2021 was carried out on 3 scientific and technical programmes within the framework of programme-targeted funding of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. All projects were carried out in the priority direction "Science of life and health".

Table - Scientific and technical programmes of NJSC MUK for 2019-2021

Name of STP	Customer:	Deadlines for implementation
O.0769 "Development of scientific foundations for the formation of a preventive environment in order to preserve public health". Scientific supervisor, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Dosmagambetova R.S.	MoH RoK	2017-2019
O .0821 "Personalized approach in management of a number of significant diseases". Scientific supervisor, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Turmukhambetova A.A.	MES RoK	2018-2020
O .1046 "COVID-19: Scientific and technological substantiation of the response system to the spread of new respiratory infections, including coronavirus infection", Doctor of Medical Sciences, Turmukhambetova A.A.	MoH RoK	2021-2023

As a co-executor of NJSC "MUK", he participated in the implementation of the STP "Development of scientific and methodological foundations for minimizing the environmental load, medical support, social protection and rehabilitation of the population of environmentally unfavorable territories of the Republic of Kazakhstan" by order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (the parent organization of NJSC "Medical University Semey", implementation period 2017-2019).

In 2021, as a co-executor, the University carried out 2 scientific and technical programmes funded from the republican budget (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan): "National programme for the introduction of personalized and preventive medicine in the Republic of Kazakhstan" (the head organization of Asfendiyarov KazNMU) and "Ageing and healthy life expectancy" (the head organization of JSOC Nazarbayev University).

In 2021, studies on a grant project with a implementation period of 36 months were started by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the topic: "Identification of the negative impact of a complex of non-ionizing radiation on the human body (on the example of medical personnel)". Scientific supervisor – Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor L.K. Ibraeva (2021-2023).

From 2016 to 2019, there were no competitions for grant funding for young scientists. In 2021, within the framework of the competition for grant funding for young scientists, research was carried out

on the grant: "Assessment of the provision of adequate water supply, sanitation and hygiene (WASH) in rural medical institutions of the Karaganda region for an effective response to the COVID-19 pandemic". The Scientific Supervisor – Omarova A.O. (implementation period 2021-2023).

Over the past five years, the following grant financing projects have been implemented:

1. Prediction of the risk of incidence of vaccine-managed infections (measles, viral hepatitis B) in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Scientific supervisor - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Kosherova B.N., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor Shaizadina F.M. (2015-2017, No. GR0115RK00303)

2. Assessment of occupational risks and health of persons working in the mining industry of Central Kazakhstan. Scientific supervisor - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Sraubaev E.N. (2018-2020, No. GR 0118RK01016)

3. Ecology and health of intellectual workers in the age aspect (on the example of university teachers). Scientific supervisor - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.K. Smagulov (2018-2020, GR 0118RK01353)

Scientists of NJSC MUK performed research works financed from the funds of economic entities under contracts with domestic and foreign organizations, including 10 clinical studies, including 3 international multicenter clinical studies (phase III).

The customers of clinical studies are foreign (LLC "EbbVi", Moscow; Cromos Pharma LLC, Dublin; Crocus Medical B.V., Moscow; NPF "Materiala Medika Holding", Moscow) and domestic developers/sponsors (Joint Stock Company "Scientific Center for Anti-Infective Drugs", JSC "Khimpharm"; JSC "IR&PH" Phytochemistry", LLP "X-Matrix"). The customers of preclinical studies for the reporting period were JSC "IR&PH" Phytochemistry", Eurasian National University, LLP "IOSU", LLP "EurasiaInvest Ltd".

Performance of economic contract works on sanitary and hygienic researches, certification of production facilities on working conditions, assessment of occupational risks was carried out for various industries on the order of such enterprises as JSC "Kostanay Minerals", SE "Petropavlovsk Branch" FSUE SUZHD, JSC "Russian Railways", etc.

It is noteworthy that the university supports the development of new promising research areas through the implementation of scientific research at the expense of university grants to increase the scientific potential of the university, increase the publication activity of teaching staff and students, the involvement of students in research, which can contribute to obtaining preliminary results for subsequent participation in competitions held in Kazakhstan and abroad.

It should be noted that over the past five years, the University has received 23 patents based on the results of scientific research, including 3 patents of the Eurasian Patent Office, more than 300 certificates of state registration of copyright, published more than 200 articles in foreign publications indexed in the database Scopus and Web of Science.

The achievements of the University in the field of research can be judged by the results of the annual ratings of educational organizations in the field of health care, conducted by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan: I place in the period from 2014-2017 and II place in the performance of scientific and innovative activities at the end of 2018-2019. In addition, in 2016, an employee of the University won an independent international award "Leader of Science" in the nomination "Articles of Kazakhstan in journals with a high impact factor in the field of medicine" from the international company Thomson Reuters (Clarivate). In 2017, an employee of the University became the winner of the Republican online contest of inventors "Shapagat 2017" (3rd place). According to the results of the republican contest "Best in the health care system", the title "Best scientist – 2018" was awarded to Doctor of Biological Sciences, Professor Muravleva L.E. and "Best scientist – 2019" PhD Dmitry Babenko

At the same time, the Laboratory is not used in all directions of its capacity.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 6 standards: fully – 5, partially -1.

Standard 1: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To develop further internationalization of doctoral programmes. To consider the possibility of concluding contracts with leading domestic and foreign scientific centers.
2. It is necessary to ensure the use of a shared laboratory for all capacities, since it is intended for microbiological, immunological, chromatographic, molecular genetic studies and sequencing,

Standard 2: OUTCOMES

Evidence of compliance:

Key learning outcomes in the areas of training and groups of educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education in the area of training "Health care" were discussed and agreed at the meeting of the Department of Health care of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on March 19, 2019, agreed with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The requirements for the level of the doctoral student's training are determined on the basis of the Dublin descriptors of the third level of higher education (doctoral studies) and reflect the mastered competencies expressed in the achieved learning outcomes. Areas of professional competence were developed for doctoral studies, taking into account the requirements of employers and the society of social demands.

The PhD programme was approved by the Academic Committee (Minutes No.6 dated April 23, 2019) and approved at the meeting of the Scientific Council of MUK NJSC (Minutes No.11 dated April 25, 2019). Entered into the Register of Educational Programmes, passed the examination procedure, registered in the Register on August 16, 2019.

The EP is formed in the form of the Regulation on the management of the educational programme of MUK NJSC (MUK National Academy of Education 1.4/2-04), contains the competencies of the graduate, learning outcomes, a map of competencies/learning outcomes, a matrix of competencies/learning outcomes, information on disciplines with an indication of the formed learning outcomes.

The quality assessment of EP is carried out by the School Quality Assurance Commission. The educational programme is discussed at the Research School Board, reviewed by the Board and approved by the Board of Directors.

By its structure and methods of training, the EP shapes the need to keep abreast of current trends in health care, develops doctoral students' skills for lifelong learning. Areas of professional competence of doctoral students are developed taking into account the opinion of employers.

Analysis of the data on the completion of studies under the accredited educational programme showed that the share of doctoral students who did not complete their studies within 3 years after admission does not exceed 22%. The number expelled due to academic indebtedness, delays in mastering the educational programme, failure to perform scientific research – 0%, at the doctorate student's own request – 15%, who went on academic leave due to illness was 7%.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 3 standards: full – 3.

Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Include a representative of employers in the Council of the Research School (School Quality Assurance Commission) (2.1, 2.2);
2. Conduct systematic analysis of feedback from employers followed by corrective actions (2.3).

Standard 3: ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA

Evidence of compliance:

The formation of the contingent of PhD students of the University is carried out by placing a state educational order for the training of scientific and pedagogical personnel. The programme is in demand. Selection for the doctorate level is carried out in accordance with the NLA from among graduates of the master's degree, residency meeting the requirements.

It is established that doctoral students enter the organization of education with a certain scientific reserve. Prior to the entrance examinations from February 1 to May 31 of the calendar year, the preliminary selection of applicants for the educational programmes of the doctoral programme is carried out at NJSC "MUK". The procedure for pre-selection for training in the educational programmes of the doctoral programme is reflected in the Policy of admission of students to the NJSC "MUK". The applicant submits for preliminary selection an abstract of the dissertation study, which includes the relevance of the study with the elements of justification, working hypothesis, purpose and objectives of the study, study design, materials and methods of the study, scientific novelty, practical significance of the results, as well as a list of the literature used. A list of works is also provided, if available. For the period of preliminary selection, the examination committee for the selection of PhD doctoral students is approved.

Members of the commission at an oral interview assess the research potential of applicants when discussing the abstract of the dissertation research, the level of motivation based on the submitted essay. One of the evaluation criteria is the level of professional competencies/experience/knowledge in the field of research, readiness to conduct research. Every year, in accordance with the regulations, MUK NJSC submits an application for placement of a state order for training within the framework of a doctorate. The application is submitted on the basis of the analysis of the resource potential of the university (staffing and qualification level of pedagogical workers, research activities of teaching staff, material and technical support, etc.), reflected in the information card of the university. The number of doctoral students is planned in accordance with the needs of the health care system at the republican and regional levels.

The first recruitment of doctoral students for the educational programme of the doctoral programme of the specialty «Public Health Care» (scientific and pedagogical direction) was carried out in the 2013-2014 academic year. Since the beginning of the implementation of the educational programme of the doctoral programme in the specialty "Public Health" 33 doctoral students have been enrolled in training, 21 people have been trained, 7 doctoral dissertations have been successfully defended, 7 graduates have been awarded the PhD degree, 7 people continue their studies.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 6 standards: 6 in full.

Standard 3: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Consider the possibility of developing a policy for the admission of foreign candidates for doctoral studies in order to increase the national and international rating of MUK.

Standard 4: PHD TRAINING PROGRAMME

Evidence of compliance:

The educational programme of the PhD 8D10139 «Public Health Care» is implemented on the basis of the license for educational activities № KZ32LAA00016018 dated May 06, 2019. The educational programme is carried out in an educational environment that meets the regulatory requirements, the needs of personal and spiritual development, meeting the challenges facing modern health care. The educational programme of PhD 8D10139 «Public Health Care» is developed in accordance with the principles of fundamental training, unity of education, science and practice.

The goal of the educational programme of the doctoral programme 8D10139 «Public Health Care» is to master the doctoral students' skills of research work on research and solving urgent problems in the field of health.

The goals of the PhD educational programme «Public Health Care» correspond to the mission of MUK NJSC, the Development Programme of the Research University for 2019-2023, the goals and objectives of the university and meeting the needs of students to obtain the declared qualifications and competencies.

Setting and implementation of the goals of the educational programme was carried out in the context of the State Programme for the Development of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020, the State Programmes for the Development of Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the SCES. University departments and divisions participate in the implementation of the educational programme.

Within the framework of the international Erasmus+ project, funded by the European Union to increase the potential of higher education, "Setting review tools and goals for medical (health) education (SPRING)", work is being carried out to introduce tools for evaluating educational programmes, training academic and administrative staff of medical universities in the field of examination of educational programmes, the development of educational technologies for the training of international experts in the field of accreditation of EP. In 2021, a group of experts from European partner universities assessed the EP "General Medicine" and "Dentistry" in accordance with ESG standards.

Information about the educational programmes of the doctoral programme is presented on the Education page, here the doctoral student can also get acquainted with the [Academic Policy of the university](#), with the academic mobility programmes, the schedule of classes and go to the student portal for information on the disciplines of the EP. The page "Science" provides information about the collegial bodies of NJSC "MUK" in the field of science: [the Bioethics Committee](#), [Dissertation Councils](#) and other collegial bodies. He has the opportunity to get acquainted with the research activities of the university and individual scientists. To receive methodological assistance on the ethical examination of research and protection of intellectual property obtained during the performance of the dissertation. This page contains information about the scientific and practical journal "[Medicine and Ecology](#)". The information is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with the Head of the Public Health Service – Dauletkaliyeva Zhania Abayevna.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 10 standards: fully – 9, partially – 1, non-compliant – 1

Standard 4: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Develop the use of elements of an interdisciplinary approach.
2. In the future, support the quality assurance system of the educational programme. Implement the experience of evaluating the educational programme in accordance with ESG standards to test the developed tool for internal assessment of the quality of the accredited doctoral programme.

Standard 5: SUPERVISION

Evidence of compliance:

The formation of a pool of scientific managers is carried out in accordance with the "Regulations on doctoral studies in the NJSC "MUK".

Approaches in the scientific management of doctoral students demonstrate the following:

Candidates of scientific consultants of doctoral students of the Public Health EP are considered and discussed at the School Council and approved at the meeting of the University Senate in accordance with the "Regulations on Doctoral Studies in the NJSC "MUK "and the [Academic Policy](#) of the NJSC "MUK ". "Regulations on doctoral studies in NJSC MUK" was approved by the decision of the Management Board on August 26, 2019 (Minutes No.8), and amendments were made on November 18, 2020 (Minutes No.24). On the basis of the decision of the Senate, the approval of candidates for scientific

consultants is formalized by the order of the Chairperson of the Management Board - Rector of MUK NJSC.

In their activities, scientific consultants are guided by the current legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan on science, regulatory acts of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, SCES.

To teach the subjects of the educational programme 8D10139 «Public Health Care», the teaching staff is involved, which meets the requirements of paragraph 110 of the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 17, 2015 No. 391 "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities, and the list of documents confirming their compliance" (Table 16 of the Attachment). The number and composition of teaching staff is sufficient for the high-quality implementation of the programme disciplines, the degree of teaching staff is 100%.

The number of doctoral students assigned to the main scientific consultant does not exceed three students. When performing dissertation research at the intersection of various scientific areas, for example, research in the field of public health and hygiene, epidemiology, clinical medicine, it is practiced to appoint several doctoral advisers in these scientific areas. In such cases, the workload is shared among all consultants who are university employees.

The duties of scientific consultants are reflected in paragraph 48 of the "Regulations on doctoral studies in the NJSC "MUK".

In order to develop the professional and scientific potential of teaching staff, scientific consultants and potential supervisors of doctoral students, training courses on improving pedagogical qualifications, research methodology, and the policy of implementing educational programmes, including doctoral studies, are regularly held at NJSC "MUK". Relevant certificates are available.

In accordance with the traditions and values of the University, all participants in the educational process comply with the accepted standards of academic policy and academic honesty.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 14 standards: fully -11, partially – 3.

Standard 5: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Conclude tripartite agreements with consultants, including foreign, university and doctoral students, describing the process of scientific leadership and establishing the responsibility of each of the parties.
2. Provide for the organization of formal training on scientific guidance for scientific managers.
3. Explore the possibility of appointing a mentor for each doctoral student in addition to the supervisor in order to discuss the PhD EP from different perspectives.

Standard 6: PhD THESIS

Evidence of compliance:

The principles of academic honesty are being instilled. At the university, there is an examination of the work performed (materials for publications, dissertation works) by scientific supervisors and doctoral students for self-control and verification of their own works using licensed information programmes (until 2018, the Anti-Plagiarism information resource based on a contract with Anti-Plagiarism CJSC (Russian Federation), since 2018, the Turnitin programme, since 2022, the Strikeplagiarism platform).

Doctoral students have access to all the necessary databases. The university has access to Clarivate Analytics, Scopus, SpringerLink, and the Elsevier information platform through the national subscription of educational organizations.

Based on the needs of students, training seminars are organized (on biostatistics, management of scientific research, etc.).

The plan of scientific internships, publications, participation in conferences is reflected in the individual plan of the doctoral student.

There is an example of defending the dissertation in English.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 11 of the standard: fully – 11, partial compliance - 1.

Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Increase the number of publications in international peer-reviewed publications, as well as attract foreign specialists to participate in scientific works.

Standard 7: ASSESSMENT

Evidence of compliance:

It has been established that the organization has introduced an appropriate evaluation policy that allows a comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of doctoral students and the submission of a dissertation to the Thesis Council (TC). The meeting with the members of the TC in the specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care» demonstrated the existence of a stable practice in the accredited organization to review, discuss and decide on the dissertation. During the interview, doctoral students told about the forms of training, consulting and evaluation, the organization of seminars and consultations in the necessary areas (statistics, research methodology, etc.), that they are satisfied with everything and receive regular feedback from teachers and scientific leaders.

Consideration of appeals against the decisions of the dissertation council and the Committee for Ensuring Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan when refusing to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor of Philosophy in the field is carried out in accordance with Chapter 5 of the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 31, 2011 No. 127 "[On approval of the Rules for the award of degrees](#)". An appeal against a negative decision of the dissertation council shall be submitted by the doctoral student in any form within 2 (two) months from the date of the decision to the university where the thesis was defended. If the appeal is filed against the decision of the dissertation council at the university, the positive conclusion of the appeal commission and the dissertation are sent to the Committee within 15 (fifteen) calendar days for a final decision. The decision of the appeal commission within 5 (five) working days from the date of its adoption is communicated to the doctoral student and posted on the Internet resource of NJSC "MUK". Disputes that are not settled by the Model Regulations on the Dissertation Council and the Regulations on the Dissertation Council of MUK NJSC, including on the issues of refusal to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), Doctor in the field, restoration of the deadline for filing an appeal, shall be resolved in court in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

There were no appeals against the decisions of the Thesis Board and the Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan when refusing to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) during the reporting period.

Until now, there are no cases of a negative decision on the dissertations performed at the university.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 10 standards: full - 9, partial -1

Standard 7: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. In view of the absence in the permanent staff of the dissertation council in the specialty 6D110200 «Public Health Care» of scientists – representatives of foreign universities, in the future to attract as members of the temporary staff of foreign scientists.

Standard 8: GRADUATE INSTITUTION STRUCTURE

Evidence of compliance:

The financial activities of the university are implemented in accordance with the Development Plan approved for five years by the decision of the Board of Directors. The Development Plan is periodically adjusted according to the requirements in accordance with the regulations and based on the results of the analysis of the implementation of the Development Programme.

The university practices separate accounting of finances for educational programmes. The budget of programmes of educational services for the training of doctoral students is based on the needs necessary for the educational process: equipment of the material and technical base, the cost of scientific internship in the near and far abroad, the cost of academic mobility, participation in scientific conferences.

Information about the educational programmes of the doctoral programme is available for students in the "Education" tab, where the doctoral student can get acquainted with the [Academic Policy of the university](#), academic mobility programmes, the schedule of classes and go to the portal for information on the disciplines of the EP. The page "Science" provides information about the collegial bodies of NJSC "MUK" in the field of science: [the Bioethics Committee](#), [Dissertation Councils](#) and other collegial bodies.

Changes to the structure of the EP are made in accordance with the recommendations of the accreditation agency (according to the plan for the implementation of post-accreditation monitoring), changes to the regulatory framework. For example, according to State Standard No.604, changes were made to the structure of the list of disciplines: the disciplines "Academic Letter" and "Methods of Scientific Research" for all EP were introduced as a university component of the basic disciplines, the number of RWDS credits and pedagogical practice increased.

Quality assessment at the level of the educational programme is carried out by the School's Quality Assurance Commission, at the institutional level it is provided by the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management.

6. In order to implement the principles of academic honesty and transparency of the organization and control of the educational process, the University provides for an appeal system.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 9 of the standards: full – 9.

Standard 8: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Continue the policy of material support for teachers and doctoral students in terms of publication activity, including appropriate expenditure items in the development plan.

6. Recommendations for improving the PhD educational programme in the specialty 8D10139 «Public Health Care»

Standard 1:

1. To develop further internationalization of doctoral programmes. To consider the possibility of concluding contracts with leading domestic and foreign scientific centers.

2. It is necessary to ensure the use of a shared laboratory for all capacities, since it is intended for microbiological, immunological, chromatographic, molecular genetic studies and sequencing,

Standard 2:

3. Include a representative of employers in the Council of the Research School (School Quality Assurance Commission) (2.1, 2.2);

4. Conduct systematic analysis of feedback from employers followed by corrective actions (2.3).

STANDARD 3.

5. Consider the possibility of developing a policy for the admission of foreign candidates for doctoral studies in order to increase the national and international rating of MUK.

Standard 4:

6. Develop the use of elements of an interdisciplinary approach.

7. In the future, support the quality assurance system of the educational programme. Implement the experience of evaluating the educational programme in accordance with ESG standards to test the developed tool for internal assessment of the quality of the accredited doctoral programme.

Standard 5:

8. Conclude tripartite agreements with consultants, including foreign, university and doctoral students, describing the process of scientific leadership and establishing the responsibility of each of the parties (5.9, 5.11).

9. Provide for the organization of formal training on scientific guidance for scientific managers (5.10, 5.12)

10. Explore the possibility of appointing a mentor for each doctoral student in addition to the supervisor in order to discuss the PhD EP from different perspectives (5.11,5.14).

Standard 7:

8. In view of the absence in the permanent staff of the dissertation council in the specialty 6D110200 «Public Health Care» of scientists – representatives of foreign universities, in the future to attract as members of the temporary staff of foreign scientists.

Standard 8:

9. Continue the policy of material support for teachers and doctoral students in terms of publication activity, including appropriate expenditure items in the development plan.

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC found the PhD study programme in 8D10139 «Public Health Care» to be in line with the Accreditation Standards and agreed to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council that the programme be accredited for a period of 5 years.

	Full name
chairperson	KAUYSHEVA ALMAGUL AMANGELDINOVNA
Foreign Expert	RAKHIMOV BAHODIR BAHTIYOR SHULLI
Academic Expert	OSTENOVA GULBARAM OMARGAZIEVA
Academic Expert	TULEUTAeva RAYKHAN ESENZHANOVNA
Employers' representative	EKATERINA KAMYLEVNA PAVLOVA
Representative of undergraduates	MAHMOUD NAZERKE SAIDUALIKYZY

Observer for ECAQA - M.A. Umarova

Handwritten signatures of the accreditation council members and the observer, corresponding to the roles listed in the table above.

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT	6	5	1	
2	OUTCOMES	3	3		
3	ADMISSION POLICY AND CRITERIA	6	6		
4	PHD TRAINING PROGRAMME	10	9	1	
5	SUPERVISION	14	11	3	
6	PhD THESIS	11	11		
7	ASSESSMENT	10	10		
8	GRADUATE INSTITUTION STRUCTURE	9	9		
	Total:	69	64	5	

List of documents studied by the members of the EEC within the framework of accreditation period of external expert evaluation: April 27-29, 2022

№	Names of documents	Quantity	Date of approval
1.	Educational programme 8D10139 public health (order No.30 of the Board of Directors)	1	24.06.21
2.	Order of Karaganda State Medical University No.39 dated 01.03.2022 "On Referral for Training"	1	01.03.2022
3.	Extract from Minutes No.11, 31.08.2021 of the Extraordinary Meeting of the Council of the Research School	1	31.08.2021
4.	Decision of the Committee on Bioethics of the MUK NJSC, Meeting No.8, Minutes No.8 dated 10.11.2020. Main researchers: K.E. Nukestaeva	1	10.11.2020
5.	Decision of the Committee on Bioethics of the NJSC MUK, Meeting No.20, Minutes No.20 dated May 19, 2021. Main researchers: Kuanysh Zh.M.	1	19.05.2021
6.	Order No.1 on the Research School. Approved on 01.09.2021 Dean of the Research School: T.T. Edilbayeva	1	01.09.2021
7.	Regulations on postdoctoral studies in the National Academy of Sciences of the Ministry OF Education and Science. Approved on 10.06.2019 Minutes No.1 of the Management Board	1	10.06.2019
8.	Regulations on doctoral studies in the NJSC "MUK". Approved on 26.08.2019. Minutes No.8 of the Management Board	1	26.08.2019
9.	Regulations on the remuneration of the personnel of the NJSC "MUK", Approved on 16.08.2022. Minutes No.22 of the Management Board	1	16.08.2022
10.	Work plan of the Research School Quality Assurance Commission. Approved on 31.08.2021 by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs	1	31.08.2021
11.	Order No. 43 dated 04.03.2022 "On Referral for Internship"	1	04.03.2022
12.	Academic policy dated 27.08.21 (pr.1 of the Senate)	1	27.08.2021
13.	The contract of the international project Erasmus+ "SPRING".	1	2019-2022
14.	Information on internal quality monitoring of EP NJSC MUK.	1	2019-2022
15.	List of projects performed on the basis of paintwork 2021-2022	1	2019-2022
16.	Regulation on the Committee on Bioethics of NJSC MUK. Approved on 20.04.2021. Minutes No.12 of the Management Board	1	20.04.2021
17.	Report of the NJSC MUK Committee on Bioethics	1	2019-2022

18.	Link to Google Drive: https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ETcEJ-KWuvJKAXdBBVtU1NJzpsO4wMgp		
-----	--	--	--

ECAQA